



Acquisition Research Program:  
Creating Synergy for Informed Change

## **GLOBAL COOPERATION AND COMPETITION IN THE DEFENSE AND AEROSPACE INDUSTRIES**

Raymond Franck, Ira Lewis, Bernard Udis

Naval Postgraduate School

PANEL 18, 13 MAY 2010

<b>Report Documentation Page</b>			Form Approved OMB No. 0704-0188					
<p>Public reporting burden for the collection of information is estimated to average 1 hour per response, including the time for reviewing instructions, searching existing data sources, gathering and maintaining the data needed, and completing and reviewing the collection of information. Send comments regarding this burden estimate or any other aspect of this collection of information, including suggestions for reducing this burden, to Washington Headquarters Services, Directorate for Information Operations and Reports, 1215 Jefferson Davis Highway, Suite 1204, Arlington VA 22202-4302. Respondents should be aware that notwithstanding any other provision of law, no person shall be subject to a penalty for failing to comply with a collection of information if it does not display a currently valid OMB control number.</p>								
1. REPORT DATE <b>13 MAY 2010</b>	2. REPORT TYPE	3. DATES COVERED <b>00-00-2010 to 00-00-2010</b>						
4. TITLE AND SUBTITLE <b>Global Cooperation and Competition in the Defense and Aerospace Industries</b>			5a. CONTRACT NUMBER					
			5b. GRANT NUMBER					
			5c. PROGRAM ELEMENT NUMBER					
6. AUTHOR(S)			5d. PROJECT NUMBER					
			5e. TASK NUMBER					
			5f. WORK UNIT NUMBER					
7. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) <b>Naval Postgraduate School, Monterey, CA, 93943</b>			8. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION REPORT NUMBER					
9. SPONSORING/MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES)			10. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S)					
			11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S REPORT NUMBER(S)					
12. DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY STATEMENT <b>Approved for public release; distribution unlimited</b>								
13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES <b>7th Annual Acquisition Research Symposium to be held May 12-13, 2010 in Monterey, California.</b>								
14. ABSTRACT								
15. SUBJECT TERMS								
16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF:  <table border="1"> <tr> <td>a. REPORT <b>unclassified</b></td> <td>b. ABSTRACT <b>unclassified</b></td> <td>c. THIS PAGE <b>unclassified</b></td> </tr> </table>			a. REPORT <b>unclassified</b>	b. ABSTRACT <b>unclassified</b>	c. THIS PAGE <b>unclassified</b>	17. LIMITATION OF ABSTRACT <b>Same as Report (SAR)</b>	18. NUMBER OF PAGES <b>24</b>	19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON
a. REPORT <b>unclassified</b>	b. ABSTRACT <b>unclassified</b>	c. THIS PAGE <b>unclassified</b>						

# **... A CONTINUING PROJECT**

- FY07/08: “Echoes across the Pond: Understanding EU-US Defense Industrial Relationships”
- FY08: “New Patterns of Rivalry and Collaboration in the US and European Defense and Aerospace Industries” (last year’s Symposium)
- FY09: “Global Cooperation and Competition in the Defense and Aerospace Industries” (today)
- FY10: Emerging Patterns in the Global Defense Industry (in progress)



# OUTLINE

- INTRODUCTION
- KC-X COMPETITION
- AIRBUS A400M DEVELOPMENT
- EMERGING (OR NOT) NORDIC DEFENSE BLOC
- CONCLUDING THOUGHTS



# KC-X COMPETITION AND THE “QUARRELSOME COMMITTEE”

AN INTERESTING CONFLUENCE OF TRENDS

- INCREASING CONCENTRATION IN THE INDUSTRIAL BASE ... ONE US SUPPLIER
- GLOBALIZATION ... EADS ENTRY INTO NORTH AMERICA
- CORPORATE STRATEGY
- INTERNATIONAL PARTNERSHIPS
- NEW PARADIGMS ... MODEL III VS. SOVEREIGN MONOPSONIST



# PREVIOUS DISCUSSIONS OF KC-X

- 07/08: EADS CORPORATE STRATEGY
- 08: EADS VS. BOEING ... ORIGINAL KC-X COMPETITION, AND AFTERMATH
  - NEED TO RECONSIDER THE STANDARD MODEL
- 09: EVALUATING PARADIGMS:  
SOVEREIGN MONOPSONIST VS. MODEL III



# **ALLISON'S MODEL III: GOVERNMENT POLITICS**

- POLICY OUTCOMES DRIVEN BY THE “PULLING AND HAULING” OF DIVERSE Factions WITHIN THE GOVERNMENT

“Sometimes one group ... triumphs over other groups .... Equally often, however, different groups pulling in different directions produce a result ... distinct from what any person or group intended.”
- MODEL III ADVOCATES EMBRACING MANY COMPLEXITIES



# ESSENTIALS OF MODEL III ANALYSIS

- WHO ARE THE PLAYERS?
- IN WHAT CONTEXTS ARE THEY OPERATING?
  - PAST HISTORIES
  - IMPORTANCE ASSIGNED TO THE ISSUE AT HAND (COMMITMENT)
  - OTHER ISSUES ON THE AGENDA
  - RELATIVE BARGAINING POWER
- WHAT'S THE NATURE OF THE PLAYING FIELD ("ACTION CHANNELS")?
  - WHO GETS TO PLAY?
  - WHAT RULES GOVERN PLAYERS' INTERACTIONS?
  - WHAT DETERMINES WHEN A DECISION IS REACHED?



# MODEL III PROPOSITIONS

- OUTCOMES A FUNCTION OF ...
  - PLAYERS' RELATIVE SKILLS
  - POWER (SITUATIONAL)
  - COMMITMENT
  - GAME "INFRASTRUCTURE"
- ... AND FACILITATED BY CLEAR RULES AND WELL-ORGANIZED ACTION CHANNELS
- TWO POINTS OF COMPARISON
  - WELL FUNCTIONING: CUBAN MISSILE CRISIS OF 1962
  - DISFUNCTIONAL: SREBENICA MASSACRE OF 1995



# THREE EPISODES

1. KC-767 LEASE-BUY PROPOSAL  
... AND UNTIMELY END
2. THE FIRST BOEING-EADS/NG  
COMPETITION ... AND  
AFTERMATH (2007-2008)
3. THE SECOND COMPETITION  
(2009- )



# THE FIRST COMPETITION (2007-2008)

- PLAYERS
  - INDUSTRIAL: BOEING, EADS, NG
  - POLITICAL: BOEING FACTION, EADS-NG FACTION, FREE AGENTS
- GAME NARRATIVE (VIEWED FROM OUTSIDE)
  - RfP(JAN 07): EADS-NG OBJECTS; RFP REVISED
  - AWARD (FEB 08) TO KC-330; BOEING PROTESTS
  - GAO SUSTAINS THE PROTEST (JUN 08)
  - ABORTIVE RECOMPETITION (2008) ... BOEING THREATENS NOT TO RESPOND TO NEW RfP



# COMMENTS

- REDISTRIBUTION OF POWER ... TOWARD THE INDUSTRIAL PLAYER
  - SUCCESSFULLY INFLUENCED RfPs AND COURSE OF COMPETITION
- MULTIPLE VETO HOLDERS
- POSSIBLE TO REACH A RESULT NO PLAYER INTENDED ... DOING NOTHING IN THIS CASE



# ASSESSING THE PARADIGMS

- “QUARRELSOME COMMITTEE” IS A BETTER CHARACTERIZATION OF THE US GOVERNMENT THAN “SOVEREIGN MONOPOLIST”
- MODEL III IS REASONABLY GOOD WAY TO SYSTEMATIZE THE QUARRELSOME COMMITTEE PERSPECTIVE
  - A DISFUNCTIONAL GAME STRUCTURE



# A400M DEVELOPMENT OUTLINE

- GENESIS OF THE PROJECT
- RECONCILING GLOBALIZATION AND REGIONAL AUTONOMY
  - STRUCTURE OF THE ENTERPRISE
  - THE ENGINE CHOICE
- RESULTING DIFFICULTIES
- CONSEQUENCES FOR THE A400 PROGRAM



# A400M OVERVIEW

- A EUROPEAN CONCEPT, THROUGH A CONSORTIUM OF SIX NATIONS
- EADS' FIRST AIRCRAFT SPECIFICALLY DESIGNED FOR MILITARY USE
  - INTENDED AS A HERCULES/TRANSALL REPLACEMENT
  - FIXED PRICE "COMMERCIAL" CONTRACT
  - AMBITIOUS SCHEDULE



# THE ENGINE DISASTER

- CUSTOMERS REJECTED AN AVAILABLE PRATT & WHITNEY
- ... IN FAVOR OF A EUROPEAN PRODUCT DEVELOPED ESSENTIALLY FROM SCRATCH
- SOFTWARE CERTIFICATION PROBLEMS ... RESULTING IN COST, PERFORMANCE AND SCHEDULE PROBLEMS



# LESSONS LEARNED

- LACK OF LEAD NATION, OR CLEAR RESPONSIBILITIES, A KEY INGREDIENT FOR FAILURE
- OUTSOURCING CAN BE TAKEN TOO FAR (B787), AND SO CAN AUTARKY (A400M)
- POLITICALLY-DRIVEN WORK SHARING FUNDAMENTALLY INCONSISTENT WITH FIXED PRICE ARRANGEMENTS



# NORDIC DEFENSE BLOC (OR NOT): ATTRACTING VS. CENTRIFUGAL FACTORS

## BACKGROUND

- COMMON HISTORY AND CULTURE
- HISTORICAL GRIEVANCES
- MORE RECENT DEVELOPMENTS
  - NORDIC COUNCIL (FROM 1950s)
  - VARIOUS ORGANIZATIONS FOR DEFENSE COOPERATION
  - STOLTENBERG REPORT (2008): ADVOCATED COMMON NORDIC ACTION ... IN PURSUIT OF COMMON INTERESTS AND WITHIN LARGER GROUPINGS (E.G., EU, NATO, UN)



# COUNTRY PERSPECTIVES: DENMARK

- COOPERATION WITH NORDIC NATIONS  
INTERESTING
- ... BUT SO IS COOPERATION WITH  
OTHER NATIONS (E.G., UK, GERMANY,  
US)
- GROWING INTEREST IN ARCTIC REGION
- NEED FOR F-16 REPLACEMENT



# FINLAND

- WWII COOPERATION WITH SWEDEN
- NON-ALIGNMENT FOR COLD WAR ...
- POST COLD WAR
  - PfP
  - MILITARY MODERNIZATION (E.G., F-18s)
  - PEACEKEEPING OPERATIONS
  - CONTINUING LACK OF SUCCESS IN ESTABLISHING A NORDIC BLOC



# **FINLAND (CONT.)**

- COMMON CULTURE AND TRUST NOT ENOUGH; NOT A SUBSTITUTE FOR BINDING SECURITY GUARANTEES (LIKE NATO)
- SOME POTENTIAL FOR USEFUL COOPERATION IN MILITARY SUPPORT FUNCTIONS
- NEED TO REPLACE F-18s ... BUT NOT SOON



# NORWAY

- RELATIVE USEFULNESS OF NORDIC VS TRANS-ATLANTIC SOLIDARITY TESTED BY JSF-GRIPEN COMPETITION TO REPLACE F-16s ... AND COOPERATION WITH SWEDEN FOR OTHER PROCUREMENTS
- PfP HELPFUL IN BUILDING FOUNDATION FOR JOINT NORDIC OPERATIONS (E.G., BETTER SWEDISH INTEGRATION)
- NORDIC COOPERATION PROMISING FOR COST SAVINGS IN MILITARY SUPPORT FUNCTIONS



# **SWEDEN**

- PfP “TRANSFORMATIVE” ... OPENING TO NATO COUNTRIES
- GROWING INTEREST IN REGIONAL SECURITY ARRANGEMENTS
- SELLING THE GRIPEN ... AND ASSOCIATED EXPORT CONTROL PROBLEMS



# **UNDERLYING DEVELOPMENTS IN THE GLOBAL DEFENSE INDUSTRIAL BASE**

- TWO ONGOING RMAs ... WITH NEW PLAYERS
- SIZE AND COMPLEXITY OF DEFENSE SYSTEMS VS. NATIONAL SOVEREIGNTY
- GLOBALIZATION OF THE DEFENSE AND AEROSPACE INDUSTRIES
- CONSOLIDATION AND SHAKEOUT OF DEFENSE INDUSTRIAL FIRMS



# SOME CLOSING THOUGHTS

- KC-X: A CONFLUENCE OF TRENDS  
LEADS TO A DISAPPOINTING PROCESS  
... AND NO RESULT
- A400M: PROBLEMS A NATURAL RESULT  
OF THE PROJECT'S STRUCTURE  
(ESPECIALLY THE POLITICAL ASPECTS)
- NORDIC BLOC: A COMPLEX SITUATION,  
WITH COUNTRIES ATTRACTED BOTH TO  
THE REGION AND ALSO TO OTHER  
PARTNERS

